arXiv:math/0303143v2 [math.NT] 12 May 2003

# THE $p$-PART OF TATE-SHAFAREVICH GROUPS OF ELLIPTIC CURVES CAN BE ARBITRARILY LARGE

REMKE KLOOSTERMAN

Abstract. In this paper it is shown that for every prime $p > 5$ the dimension of the $p$-torsion in the Tate-Shafarevich group of $E/K$ can be arbitrarily large, where $E$ is an elliptic curve defined over a number field $K$, with $[K : \mathbf{Q}]$ bounded by a constant depending only on $p$. From this we deduce that the dimension of the $p$-torsion in the Tate-Shafarevich group of $A/\mathbf{Q}$ can be arbitrarily large, where $A$ is an abelian variety, with $\dim A$ bounded by a constant depending only on $p$.

## 1. Introduction

For the notations used in this introduction we refer to Section 2.

The aim of this paper is to give a proof of

**Theorem 1.1.** *There is a function $g : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{Z}$ such that for every prime number $p$ and every $k \in \mathbf{Z}_{>0}$ there exist infinitely many pairs $(E, K)$, with $K$ a number field of degree at most $g(p)$ and $E/K$ an elliptic curve, such that*

$$\dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} Ш(E/K)[p] > k.$$

A direct consequence is:

**Corollary 1.2.** *For every prime number $p$ and every $k \in \mathbf{Z}_{>0}$ there exist infinitely many non-isomorphic abelian varieties $A/\mathbf{Q}$, with $\dim A \leq g(p)$ and $A$ is simple over $\mathbf{Q}$, such that*

$$\dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} Ш(A/\mathbf{Q})[p] > k.$$

In fact, a rough estimate using the present proof reveals that $g(p) = \mathcal{O}(p^4)$, for $p \to \infty$.

For $p \in \{2, 3, 5\}$, it is known that the group $Ш(E/\mathbf{Q})[p]$ can be arbitrarily large. (See [Böl75], [Cas64], [Fis01] and [Kr83].) So we may assume that $p > 5$, in fact, our proof only uses $p > 3$.

The proof is based on combining the strategy used in [Fis01] to prove that $\dim_{\mathbf{F}_5} Ш(E/\mathbf{Q})[5]$ can be arbitrarily large and the strategy used in [KlSc03] to prove that $\dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} S^p(E/K)$ can be arbitrarily large, where $E$ and $K$ vary, but $[K : \mathbf{Q}]$ is bounded by a function depending on $p$ of type $\mathcal{O}(p)$.

In [KlSc03] the strategy was to find a field $K$, such that $[K : \mathbf{Q}]$ is small and a point $P \in X_0(p)(K)$ such that $P$ reduces to one cusp for many primes $\mathfrak{p}$ and reduces to the other cusp for very few primes $\mathfrak{p}$. Then to $P$ we can associate an elliptic curve $E/K$ such that an application of a Theorem of Cassels ([Cas65]) shows that $S^p(E/K)$ gets large.

The strategy of [Fis01] can be described as follows. Suppose $K$ is a field with class number 1. Suppose $E/K$ has a $K$-rational point of order $p$, with $p > 3$ a prime number. Let $\varphi : E \to E'$ be the isogeny obtained by dividing out the point of order $p$. Then one can define a matrix $M$, such that the $\varphi$-Selmer group is isomorphic to the kernel of multiplication on the left by $M$, while the $\hat{\varphi}$-Selmer group is isomorphic to the kernel of multiplication on the right by $M$. One can then

---

*Date*: February 1, 2008.

1991 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 11G05; Secondary 11G18.

*Key words and phrases.* Tate-Shafarevich group, elliptic curve, abelian variety.

The author wishes to thank Jaap Top for many useful conversations on this topic. The author wishes to thank Jasper Scholten for suggesting [Mi72]. The author wishes to thank Stephen Donnolley for pointing out a mistake in an earlier version.

show that the rank of $E(K)$ and of $E'(K)$ is bounded by the number of split multiplicative primes minus twice the rank of $M$ minus 1.

Moreover, one can prove that if the matrix $M$ is far from being square, then the dimension of the $p$-Selmer group of one of the two isogenous curves is large. If one has an elliptic curve with two rational torsion points of order $p$ and $q$ respectively, one can hope that for one isogeny the associated matrix has high rank, while for the other isogeny the matrix is far from being square. Fisher uses points on $X(5)$ to find elliptic curves $E/\mathbf{Q}$ with two isogenies, one such that the associated matrix has large rank, and the other such that the 5-Selmer group is large.

We generalize this idea to number fields, without the class number 1 condition. To do this we express the Selmer group attached to the isogeny as the kernel of the multiplication on the left by some matrix $M$. In general, the matrix for the dual isogeny turns out to be different from the transpose of $M$.

*Remark* 1.3. An element of $S^p(E/K)$ corresponds to a Galois extension $L$ of $K(E[p])$ of degree $p$ or $p^2$, satisfying certain local conditions and such that the Galois group of $L/K(E[p])$ interacts in some prescribed way with the Galois group of $K(E[p])/K$. The examples of elliptic curves with large Selmer and large Tate-Shafarevich groups in [Fis01], [KlSc03] and this paper have one thing in common, namely that the representation of the absolute Galois group of $K$ on $E[p]$ is reducible. It follows that the conditions on the interaction of the Galois group of $K(E[p])/K$ with the Galois group of $L/K(E[p])$ almost disappear. The next thing to do would be to produce examples of large $p$-Selmer groups, with $p > 3$, with an irreducible Galois representation on $E[p]$. One could start with the case of elliptic curves with complex multiplication.

The organization of this paper is as follows: In Section 2 we prove several lower and upper bounds for the size of $\varphi$-Selmer groups, where $\varphi$ is an isogeny with kernel generated by a rational point of prime order at least 5. In Section 3 we use the modular curve $X(p)$ and the estimates from Section 2 to prove Theorem 1.1.

## 2. SELMER GROUPS

Suppose $K$ is a number field, $E/K$ is an elliptic curve and $\varphi : E \to E'$ is an isogeny defined over $K$. Let $H^1(K, E[\varphi])$ be the first cohomology group of the Galois module $E[\varphi]$.

**Definition 2.1.** The $\varphi$-Selmer group of $E/K$ is

$$S^{\varphi}(E/K) := \ker H^1(K, E[\varphi]) \to \prod_{\mathfrak{p} \text{ prime}} H^1(K_{\mathfrak{p}}, E).$$

and the Tate-Shafarevich group of $E/K$ is

$$Ш(E/K) := \ker H^1(K, E) \to \prod_{\mathfrak{p} \text{ prime}} H^1(K_{\mathfrak{p}}, E).$$

*Notation* 2.2. For the rest of this section fix a prime number $p > 3$, a number field $K$ such that $\zeta_p \in K$ and an elliptic curve $E/K$ such that there is a non-trivial point $P \in E(K)$ of order $p$. Let $\varphi : E \to E'$ be the isogeny obtained by dividing out $\langle P \rangle$.

To $\varphi$ we associate three sets of primes. Let $S_1(\varphi)$ be the set of split multiplicative primes, not lying above $p$, such that $P$ is not in the kernel of reduction. Let $S_2(\varphi)$ be the set of split multiplicative primes, not lying above $p$, such that $P$ is in the kernel of reduction. Let $S_3(\varphi)$ be the set of primes above $p$.

Suppose $\mathcal{S}$ is a finite sets of finite primes. Let

$$K(\mathcal{S}, p) := \{x \in K^*/K^{*p} | v_{\mathfrak{p}}(x) \equiv 0 \bmod p \, \forall \mathfrak{p} \notin \mathcal{S}\}.$$

Let $H^1(K, M; \mathcal{S})$ the subgroup of $H^1(K, M)$ of all cocycles not ramified outside $\mathcal{S}$.

For any cocycle $\xi \in H^1(K, M)$ denote $\xi_{\mathfrak{p}} := res_{\mathfrak{p}}(\xi) \in H^1(K_{\mathfrak{p}}, M)$. Let $\delta_{\mathfrak{p}}$ be the boundary map

$$E'(K_{\mathfrak{p}})/\varphi(E(K_{\mathfrak{p}})) \to H^1(K_{\mathfrak{p}}, E[\varphi]).$$

Let $C_K$ denote the class group of $K$.

Note that $S_1(\hat{\varphi}) = S_2(\varphi)$ and $S_2(\hat{\varphi}) = S_1(\varphi)$.

**Proposition 2.3.** *We have*

$$S^{\varphi}(E/K) = \{\xi \in H^1(K, E[\varphi]; S_1(\varphi) \cup S_3(\varphi)) \mid \xi_{\mathfrak{p}} = 0 \ \forall \mathfrak{p} \in S_2(\varphi) \text{ and } \xi_{\mathfrak{p}} \in \delta_{\mathfrak{p}}(E'(K_{\mathfrak{p}})/\varphi(E(K_{\mathfrak{p}}))) \ \forall \mathfrak{p} \in S_3(\varphi)\}.$$

*Proof.* Note that if $p$ divides the Tamagawa number $c_{E,\mathfrak{p}}$ then the reduction at $\mathfrak{p}$ is split multiplicative. If this is the case then $c_{E,\mathfrak{p}}/c_{E',\mathfrak{p}} \neq 1$. This combined with $\dim H^1(K_{\mathfrak{p}}, E[\varphi]) \leq 2$ (for $\mathfrak{p} \nmid (p)$) and [Sch96, Lemma 3.8] gives that $\iota_{\mathfrak{p}}^* : H^1(K_{\mathfrak{p}}, E[\varphi]) \to H^1(K_{\mathfrak{p}}, E)$ is either injective or the zero-map. A closer inspection of [Sch96, Lemma 3.8] combined with [KlSc03, Proposition 3] shows that $\iota_{\mathfrak{p}}^*$ is injective if and only if $\mathfrak{p} \in S_2(\varphi)$.

The Proposition follows then from [ScSt01, Proposition 4.6]. □

**Proposition 2.4.** *We have*

$$S^{\varphi}(E/K) \subset \{x \in K(S_1(\varphi) \cup S_3(\varphi), p) | x \in K_{\mathfrak{p}}^{*p} \ \forall \mathfrak{p} \in S_2(\varphi)\}$$

*and*

$$S^{\varphi}(E/K) \supset \{x \in K(S_1(\varphi), p) | x \in K_{\mathfrak{p}}^{*p} \ \forall \mathfrak{p} \in S_2(\varphi) \cup S_3(\varphi)\}.$$

*Proof.* This follows from the identification $E[\varphi] \cong \mathbf{Z}/p\mathbf{Z} \cong \mu_{\mathfrak{p}}$, the fact $H^1(L, \mu_p) \cong L^*/L^{*p}$ for any field $L$ of characteristic different from $p$, and Proposition 2.3. □

**Definition 2.5.** Let $\mathcal{S}_1$ and $\mathcal{S}_2$ be two disjoint finite sets of finite primes of $K$, such that none of the primes in these sets divides $(p)$.

Let

$$T : K(\mathcal{S}_1, p) \to \oplus_{\mathfrak{p} \in \mathcal{S}_2} \mathcal{O}_{\mathfrak{p}}^*/\mathcal{O}_{\mathfrak{p}}^{*p}$$

be the $\mathbf{F}_p$-linear map induced by inclusion.

Let $m(\mathcal{S}_1, \mathcal{S}_2)$ be the rank of $T$.

In the special case of an isogeny $\varphi : E \to E'$ with associated sets $S_1(\varphi)$ and $S_2(\varphi)$ as above we write $m(\varphi) := m(S_1(\varphi), S_2(\varphi))$.

Note that $K$ does not admit any real embedding. So

$$\dim K(S, p) = \frac{1}{2}[K : \mathbf{Q}] + \#S + \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p]$$

for any set of finite primes $S$.

**Proposition 2.6.** *We have*

$$\#S_1(\varphi) - \#S_2(\varphi) + \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - \frac{1}{2}[K : \mathbf{Q}] \leq \dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) \leq \#S_1(\varphi) + \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - m(\varphi) + \frac{3}{2}[K : \mathbf{Q}].$$

*Proof.* Using Proposition 2.4 twice we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
-\frac{1}{2}[K : \mathbf{Q}] + \#S_1(\varphi) + \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - \#S_2(\varphi) &\leq \dim K(S_1(\varphi), p) - \#S_2(\varphi) - \#S_3(\varphi) \\
&\leq \dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) \\
&\leq \dim K(S_1(\varphi) \cup S_3(\varphi), p) - m(\varphi) \\
&\leq \#S_1(\varphi) + \#S_3(\varphi) + \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - m(\varphi) + \frac{1}{2}[K : \mathbf{Q}] \\
&\leq \#S_1(\varphi) + \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - m(\varphi) + \frac{3}{2}[K : \mathbf{Q}].
\end{aligned}$$

□

**Lemma 2.7.** *We have*

$$\operatorname{rank} E(K) \leq \#S_1(\varphi) + \#S_2(\varphi) + 2\dim C_K[p] + 3[K : \mathbf{Q}] - m(\varphi) - m(\hat{\varphi}) - 1.$$

*Proof.* Note

$$\begin{aligned} 1+\operatorname{rank} E(K) &\leq \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} E(K)/pE(K) \leq \dim S^p(E/K) \leq \dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) + \dim S^{\hat{\varphi}}(E'/K) \\ &\leq \#S_1(\varphi) + \#S_1(\hat{\varphi}) + 2\dim C_K[p] + 3[K:\mathbf{Q}] - m(\varphi) - m(\hat{\varphi}), \end{aligned}$$

which proves the Lemma. ☐

By a theorem of Cassels we can compute the difference of $\dim S^{\varphi}(E/K)$ and $\dim S^{\hat{\varphi}}(E'/K)$. We do not need the precise difference, but only an estimate, namely

**Lemma 2.8.** *There is an integer $t$, with $|t| \leq 2[K:\mathbf{Q}]+1$ such that*

$$\dim S^{\hat{\varphi}}(E'/K) = \dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) - \#S_1(\varphi) + \#S_2(\varphi) + t.$$

*Proof.* This follows from [Cas65] and [KlSc03, Proposition 3]. ☐

**Lemma 2.9.**

$$\dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) + \dim S^{\hat{\varphi}}(E'/K) \geq |\#S_1(\varphi) - \#S_2(\varphi)| + 2\dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - 3[K:\mathbf{Q}] - 1.$$

*Proof.* We may assume that $\#S_1 \geq \#S_2$. From Proposition 2.6 we know

$$\dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) \geq \#S_1(\varphi) - \#S_2(\varphi) + \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - \frac{1}{2}[K:\mathbf{Q}].$$

From this inequality and Lemma 2.8 we obtain that

$$\dim S^{\hat{\varphi}}(E'/K) \geq \dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) - 2[K:\mathbf{Q}] - 1 - \#S_1(\varphi) + \#S_2(\varphi) \geq \dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} C_K[p] - \frac{5}{2}[K:\mathbf{Q}] - 1.$$

Summing both inequalities gives the Lemma. ☐

**Lemma 2.10.** *Suppose* $\dim S^{\varphi}(E/K) + \dim S^{\hat{\varphi}}(E/'K) = k+1$ *and* $\operatorname{rank} E(K) = r$*, then*

$$\max(\dim Ш(E/K)[p], \dim Ш(E'/K)[p]) \geq \frac{(k-r)}{2}.$$

*Proof.* This follows from the exact sequence

$$0 \to E'(K)[\hat{\varphi}]/\varphi(E(K)[p]) \to S^{\varphi}(E/K) \to S^p(E/K) \to S^{\hat{\varphi}}(E'/K) \to Ш(E'/K)[\hat{\varphi}]/\varphi(Ш(E/K)[p]).$$

(See [ScSt01, Lemma 9.1].) ☐

**Lemma 2.11.** *Let $\psi : E_1 \to E_2$ be some isogeny obtained by dividing out a $K$-rational point of order $p$, with $E_1$ an elliptic curve in the $K$-isogeny network of $E$. Then*

$$\max(\dim Ш(E/K)[p], \dim Ш(E'/K)[p]) \geq -\min(\#S_1(\varphi), \#S_2(\varphi)) - 3[K:\mathbf{Q}] - 1 + \frac{1}{2}(m(\psi) + m(\hat{\psi})).$$

*Proof.* Use Lemma 2.7 for the isogeny $\psi$ to obtain the bound for the rank of $E(K)$. Then combine this with Lemma 2.9 and Lemma 2.10 and use that

$$\#S_1(\varphi) + \#S_2(\varphi) = \#S_1(\psi) + \#S_2(\psi).$$

☐

## 3. Modular curves

In this section we prove Theorem 1.1. The following result will be used in the proof of Theorem 1.1.

**Theorem 3.1** ([HaRi74, Theorem 10.4]). *Let $f \in \mathbf{Z}[X]$ be a polynomial of degree at least 1. Suppose that for every prime $\ell$, there exists a $y \in \mathbf{Z}/\ell\mathbf{Z}$ such that $f(y) \not\equiv 0 \bmod \ell$. Then there exists a constant $n$ depending on the degree of $f$ and the degree of its irreducible factors such that* *there exist infinitely many primes $\ell$, such that $f(\ell)$ has at most $n$ prime factors. Moreover, there exist $\delta > 0, d \in \mathbf{Z}$, such that*

$$\#\{y \in \mathbf{Z} \mid 0 \leq y \leq x \text{ and the number of prime factors of } f(y) \leq n\} \leq \delta \frac{x}{\log^d x}\left(1 + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{\log(x)}}\right)\right)$$

*as $x \to \infty$.*

*Notation* 3.2. Denote $X(p)/\mathbf{Q}$ the curve parameterizing triples $(E, Q_1, Q_2)$ with $\{Q_1, Q_2\}$ an ordered basis for $E[p]$.

By the work of Vélu (see [Vélu78], [Fis00, Chapter 4]) there exists cusps of $X(p)$ defined over $\mathbf{Q}$. Fix a cusp $T_0 \in X_p(\mathbf{Q})$. Let $R_1 \in X_0(p)$ be the unramified cusp, let $R_2 \in X_0(p)$ be the ramified cusp.

Let $\tilde{\pi}_i : X(p) \to X_0(p)$ be the morphisms obtained by mapping $(E, Q_1, Q_2)$ to $(E, \langle Q_i \rangle)$.

Let $\pi_i : X(p) \to X_0(p)$ be either $\tilde{\pi}_i$ or $\tilde{\pi}_i$ composed with the Atkin-Lehner involution on $X_0(p)$, such that $\pi_i(T_0) = R_1$.

Let $P \in X(p)$ a point, not a cusp. Denote $\varphi_{P,i}$ the morphism corresponding to $\pi_i(P)$.

Note that the maps $\pi_i$ are defined over $\mathbf{Q}$.

**Definition 3.3.** Let $T$ be a cusp of $X(p)$. We say that $T$ is of type $(\delta, \epsilon) \in \{1, 2\}^2$ if $\pi_1(T) = R_\delta$ and $\pi_2(T) = R_\epsilon$.

Note that being of type $(\delta, \epsilon)$ is invariant under the action of the absolute Galois group of $\mathbf{Q}$.

For all points $P \in X(p)(\overline{\mathbf{Q}})$ and all primes $\mathfrak{p} \nmid (p)$ of $\overline{\mathbf{Q}}$ such that $P \equiv T \bmod \mathfrak{p}$ implies that $\mathfrak{p} \in S_\delta(\varphi_{P,1})$ and $\mathfrak{p} \in S_\epsilon(\varphi_{P,2})$.

*Proof of Theorem 1.1.* Fix a component $Y$ of $X(p)/\mathbf{Q}(\zeta_p)$. Fix a (possibly singular) model $C_1$ for $Y$ in $\mathbf{P}^2$, such that the line $X = 0$ intersects $C_1$ only in cusps of type $(1, 1)$ and no other point, all $x$-coordinates of other the cusps are distinct and finite, if two $x$-coordinates of cusps are conjugate under $\mathrm{Gal}(\mathbf{Q}(\zeta_p)/\mathbf{Q})$, then the type of these cusps coincide and all $y$-coordinates of the cusps are finite. Let $C = \cup_{\sigma \in \mathrm{Gal}(\mathbf{Q}(\zeta_p)/\mathbf{Q})} C_1^\sigma$. Then $C/\mathbf{Q}$ is a model for $X(p)$.

Denote $h$ the defining polynomial of $C$.

Let $f_{\delta,\epsilon} \in \mathbf{Z}[X]$ be the radical polynomial with as roots all $x$-coordinates of the cusps of type $(\delta, \epsilon)$ of $X(p)$ and content 1. After a transformation of the form $x \mapsto cx$, we may assume that $f_{1,2}(0) f_{2,2}(0) = 1$ and $f_{1,2} f_{2,2} \in \mathbf{Z}[X]$. Let $n$ denote the constant of Theorem 3.1 for the polynomial $f_{1,2} f_{2,2}$. Note that the discriminant of $f_{1,1} f_{1,2} f_{2,1} f_{2,2}$ is non-zero.

Let $\mathcal{B}$ consist of $p$, all primes $\ell$ dividing the leading coefficient or the discriminant of $f_{1,1} f_{1,2} f_{2,1} f_{2,2}$, all primes $\ell$ smaller then the degree of $f_{1,2} f_{2,2}$ and all primes dividing the leading coefficient of $res(h, f_{2,1}, x)$.

Let $\mathcal{P}_2$ be the set of primes not in $\mathcal{B}$ such that every irreducible factor of $f_{2,1}(x)(x^p - 1) \bmod \ell$ and every irreducible factor of $res(h, f_{2,1}, x) \bmod \ell$ has degree 1. Note that by Frobenius' Theorem ([StLe96]) the set $\mathcal{P}_2$ is infinite. The condition mentioned here, implies that if we take a triple $(x_0, \ell, x_0)$ with $x_0 \in \mathbf{Z}$, the prime $\ell \in \mathcal{P}_2$ divides $f_{2,1}(x_0)$ and $y_0$ is a zero of $h(x_0, y)$ then every prime $\mathfrak{q}$ of $\mathbf{Q}(\zeta_p, y_0)$ over $\ell$ satisfies $f(\mathfrak{q}/\ell) = 1$.

Fix $\mathcal{S}_1$ and $\mathcal{S}_2$ two sets of primes, such that

$$m(\mathcal{S}_1, \mathcal{S}_2) > 2k + 4(n+3)\deg(h)(p-1) + 2,$$

$S_1 \cap \mathcal{B} = \emptyset$ and $S_2 \subset \mathcal{P}_2$. (The existence of such sets follows from Dirichlet's theorem on primes in arithmetic progression and the fact that $\ell \in \mathcal{S}_2$ implies $\ell \equiv 1 \bmod p$.)

**Lemma 3.4.** *There exists an $x_0 \in \mathbf{Z}$ such that*

- *$x_0 \equiv 0 \bmod \ell$, for all primes $\ell$ smaller then the degree of $f_{1,2} f_{2,2}$ and all $\ell$ dividing the leading coefficient of $f_{1,2} f_{2,2}$.*

- $x_0 \equiv 0 \bmod \ell$, *for all* $\ell \in \mathcal{S}_1$,
- $f_{2,1}(x_0) \equiv 0 \bmod \ell$, *for all* $\ell \in \mathcal{S}_2$,
- $f_{1,2}(x_0)f_{2,2}(x_0)$ *has at most* $n$ *prime divisors.*
- $h(x_0, y)$ *is irreducible.*

*Proof.* The existence of such an $x_0$ can be proven as follows. Take an $a \in \mathbf{Z}$ satisfying the above three congruence relations. Take $b$ to be the product of all primes mentioned in the above congruence relations. Define $\tilde{f}(Z) = f_{1,2}(a+bZ)f_{2,2}(a+bZ)$. We claim that the content of $\tilde{f}$ is one. Suppose $\ell$ divides this content. Then $\ell$ divides the leading coefficient of $\tilde{f}$. From this one deduces that $\ell$ divides $b$. We distinguish several cases:

- If $\ell \in \mathcal{S}_i$ then $f_{i,2}(a) \equiv 0 \bmod \ell$ and $\ell$ does not divide the discriminant of the product of the $f_{\delta,\epsilon}$, so we have $\tilde{f}(0) \equiv f_{1,2}(a)f_{2,2}(a) \not\equiv 0 \bmod \ell$.
- If $\ell$ divides $b$ and is not in $\mathcal{S}_1 \cup \mathcal{S}_2$ then $\tilde{f}(0) \equiv f_{1,2}(0)f_{2,2}(0) \equiv 1 \bmod \ell$.

So for all primes $\ell$ dividing $b$ we have that $\tilde{f} \not\equiv 0 \bmod \ell$. This proves the claim on the content of $\tilde{f}$.

Suppose $\ell$ is a prime smaller then the degree of $\tilde{f}$, then $\tilde{f}(0) \equiv 1 \bmod \ell$. If $\ell$ is different from these primes, then there is a coefficient of $\tilde{f}$ which is not divisible by $\ell$ and the degree of $\tilde{f}$ is smaller then $\ell$. So for every prime $\ell$ there is an $z_\ell \in \mathbf{Z}$ with $\tilde{f}(z_\ell) \not\equiv 0 \bmod \ell$. From this we deduce that we can apply Theorem 3.1. The constant for $\tilde{f}$ depends only on the degree of the irreducible factors of $\tilde{f}$, hence equals $n$. The set

$$\{x_1 \in \mathbf{Z} \mid \tilde{f}(x_1) \text{ has at most } n \text{ prime divisors}\}$$

is not a thin set. So

$$\mathcal{H} := \{x_1 \in \mathbf{Z} \mid \tilde{f}(x_1) \text{ has at most } n \text{ prime divisors and } h(a+bx_1, y) \text{ is irreducible}\}$$

is not empty by Hilbert's Irreducibility Theorem [Ser89, Chapter 9].) Fix such an $x_1 \in \mathcal{H}$. Let $x_0 = a + bx_1$. This proves the claim on the existence of such an $x_0$. □

Fix an $x_0$ satisfying the conditions of Lemma 3.4. Adjoin a root $y_0$ of $h(x_0, y)$ to $\mathbf{Q}(\zeta_p)$. Denote the field $\mathbf{Q}(\zeta_p, y_0)$ by $K_1$. Let $P$ be the point on $X(p)(K_1)$ corresponding to $(x_0, y_0)$. Let $E/K_1$ be the elliptic curve corresponding to $P$. Let $K = K_1(\sqrt{c_4(E)})$. Then if $\mathfrak{q}$ is a prime such that $E/K_\mathfrak{q}$ has multiplicative reduction, then $E/K_\mathfrak{q}$ has split multiplicative reduction.

For every prime $\mathfrak{p}$ of $K$ over $\ell \in \mathcal{S}_1$ we have that $P \bmod \mathfrak{q}$ is a cusp of type $(1, 1)$. Over every prime $\ell \in \mathcal{S}_2$ there exists a prime $\mathfrak{q}$ such that $P \bmod \mathfrak{q}$ is a cusp of type $(2, 1)$. From our assumptions on $x_0$ it follows that $p$ does not divide $f(\mathfrak{q}/\ell)$. Let $\mathcal{T}_1$ consists of the primes of $K$ lying over the primes in $\mathcal{S}_1$. Let $\mathcal{T}_2$ be the set of primes $\mathfrak{q}$ such that $\mathfrak{q}$ lies over a prime in $\mathcal{S}_2$ and $P \bmod \mathfrak{q}$ is a cusp of type $(2, 1)$.

Note that the set of primes of $K$ such that $P$ reduces to a cusp of type $(*, 2)$ has at most $n[K : \mathbf{Q}]$ elements.

We have the following diagram

$$\begin{tikzcd}
\mathbf{Q}(\mathcal{S}_1, p) \arrow[r] \arrow[d] & \oplus_{\ell \in \mathcal{S}_2} \mathbf{Z}_\ell^*/\mathbf{Z}_\ell^{*p} \arrow[d] \\
K(\mathcal{T}_1, p) \arrow[r] & \oplus_{\mathfrak{q} \in \mathcal{T}_2} \mathcal{O}_{K_\mathfrak{q}}^*/\mathcal{O}_{K_\mathfrak{q}}^{*p}.
\end{tikzcd}$$

Since $p \nmid f(\mathfrak{q}/\ell)$ for all $\ell \in \mathcal{S}_2$, the arrow in the right column is injective. This implies

$$m(\varphi_{P,1}/K) \geq m(\mathcal{T}_1, \mathcal{T}_2) \geq m(\mathcal{S}_1, \mathcal{S}_2) = 2k + 4(n+3)\deg(h)(p-1) + 2.$$

Since $S_2(\varphi_{p,2}/K) \leq [K:\mathbf{Q}]n$ and $[K:\mathbf{Q}] \leq 2(p-1)\deg(h)$ we obtain by Lemma 2.11 that for some $E'$ isogenous to $E$ we have

$$\begin{aligned}\dim_{\mathbf{F}_p} Ш(E'/K)[p] &\geq -\#S_2(\varphi_{P,2}) - 3[K:\mathbf{Q}] - 1 + \frac{1}{2}m(\mathcal{S}_1,\mathcal{S}_2)\\ &\geq (n+3)[K:\mathbf{Q}] - 1 + \frac{1}{2}m(\mathcal{S}_1,\mathcal{S}_2) = k.\end{aligned}$$

Note that $\deg(h)$ can be bounded by a function of type $\mathcal{O}(p^3)$, hence $[K:\mathbf{Q}]$ can be bounded by a function of type $\mathcal{O}(p^4)$. ☐

To finish, we prove Corollary 1.2.

*Proof of Corollary 1.2.* Let $E/K$ be an elliptic curve such that $\dim Ш(E/K)[p] \geq kg(p)$ and $[K:\mathbf{Q}] \leq g(p)$.

Let $R := Res_{K/\mathbf{Q}}(E)$ be the Weil restriction of scalars of $E$. Then by [Mi72, Proof of Theorem 1]

$$\dim Ш(R/\mathbf{Q})[p] = \dim Ш(E/K)[p].$$

From this it follows that there is a factor $A$ of $R$, with $\dim Ш(A/\mathbf{Q})[p] \geq k$. ☐

## REFERENCES

[Böl75] R. Bölling, Die Ordnung der Schafarewitsch-Tate Gruppe kann beliebig groß werden, *Math. Nachr.* **67** (1975), 157–179.

[Cas64] J.W.S. Cassels, Arithmetic on Curves of Genus 1 (VI). The Tate-Šafarevič group can be arbitrarily large, *J. Reine Angew. Math.* **214/215** (1964), 65–70.

[Cas65] J.W.S. Cassels, Arithmetic on curves of genus 1 (VIII). On the conjectures of Birch and Swinnerton-Dyer, *J. Reine Angew. Math.* **217** (1965), 180–189.

[Fis00] T. Fisher, *On 5 and 7 descents for elliptic curves*, PhD Thesis, Camebridge, 2000.

[Fis01] T. Fisher, Some examples of 5 and 7 descent for elliptic curves over $\mathbf{Q}$, *J. Eur. Math. Soc.* **3** (2001) 169–201.

[HaRi74] H. Halberstam, H.-E. Richert, *Sieve Methods*, Academic Press, London, 1974.

[KlSc03] R. Kloosterman, E.F. Schaefer, Selmer groups of elliptic curves that can be arbitrarily large, *J. Number Theory* **99** (2003), 148–163.

[Kr83] K. Kramer, A family of semistable elliptic curves with large Tate-Shafarevich groups, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **89** (1983), 379–386.

[Mi72] J. S. Milne, On the arithmetic of abelian varieties, *Invent. Math.* **17** (1972), 177–190.

[Ser89] J.-P. Serre, *Lectures on the Mordell-Weil theorem.* Aspects of Mathematics, Friedr. Vieweg & Sohn, Braunschweig, 1989.

[Sch96] E.F. Schaefer, Class groups and Selmer groups, *J. Number Theory* **56** (1996), 79–114.

[ScSt01] E.F. Schaefer and M. Stoll, How to do a $p$-descent on an elliptic curve, preprint, 2001.

[StLe96] P. Stevenhagen, H.W. Lenstra, Jr, Chebotarëv and his density theorem, *Math. Intelligencer* **18** (1996), 26–37.

[Vélu78] J. Vélu, *Courbes elliptiques munies d'un sous-groupe* $Z/nZ \times \mu_n$. Bull. Soc. Math. France Mém. No. **57**, 1978.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS AND COMPUTER SCIENCE, UNIVERSITY OF GRONINGEN, PO BOX 800, 9700 AV GRONINGEN, THE NETHERLANDS

*E-mail address*: `r.n.kloosterman@math.rug.nl`